Dialogues with Diversity: working with organisations to understand constraints and opportunities

Geoff Stone / Robin Peace
Outline

1. Background to the projects
2. Three focal points:
   • Understanding systems and structures
   • Changes over time
   • Relationships and places
3. Macro level findings
4. Potential implications for policy
Background

- Three institutional evaluations
  - English Language Partners New Zealand
  - New Zealand Police
  - CNSST Trust

- Developmental Evaluation approach

- Mixed methods

- Multiple & various outputs

- Understanding what matters for settlement outcomes
## Mental models / organisational culture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ELPNZ</th>
<th>NZ Police (Ethnic Services)</th>
<th>CNSST</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTENT</strong></td>
<td>Social good</td>
<td>Maintaining order and public safety</td>
<td>Social justice + social advancement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CONSTITUENCY</strong></td>
<td>For diverse newcomers</td>
<td>For all New Zealanders</td>
<td>For our Asian people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DISTRIBUTION</strong></td>
<td>Across Aotearoa</td>
<td>Across Aotearoa</td>
<td>In Tamaki Makaurau</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CONCERNS</strong></td>
<td>English language is foundational to successful settlement</td>
<td>Ethnic responsiveness (being trusted)</td>
<td>Integration (including preservation of culture)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SELF-PERCEPTION</strong></td>
<td>Settlement support</td>
<td>Universal service</td>
<td>Asian wrap-around social service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LOOK AND FEEL</strong></td>
<td>Informal (volunteers + professionals)</td>
<td>Formal (Uniform + few non-sworn staff)</td>
<td>Semi formal (professionals + volunteers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>RESPONSIVE CAPACITY</strong></td>
<td>Somewhat inclusive</td>
<td>Focusing on diversity</td>
<td>Inclusive by nature (by and for migrants)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Systems and structures

Intent and positioning in a disorganised service ecology (macro system)

ELPNZ example
Systems and structures

ELPNZ’s intent and functions = settlement support service

ELPNZ

23 locations

Employment

Language skills & cultural awareness suitable to workplaces

Staircasing into more advanced training

Certification for English proficiency

Knowledge and access to support services

Health & well-being

Newcomers

Inclusion

Employment

Education & training

English language

Volunteering – building social capital

Group learning and tutoring – building social and civic participation

Knowledge and opportunities for social and civic participation
Government’s prevailing perception of ELPNZ = ESOL provider

Identified issue:
A disjuncture limits what government sees in terms of constraints on settlement

78% of overall annual income is from from TEC (2015)
Intent and positioning within a disorganised service ecology (macro system)

CNNST example
Identified issue:
Disjuncture between organisational intent (wrap-around settlement service) and government perception – ‘service provider’ (multiple contracts, multiple relationship managers)
Systems and structures

Seeking to understand intent and positioning of Ethnic Services within a large government department – NZ Police

New Zealand Police Executive Structure
As at October 2016

Commissioner / Chief Executive Officer

- Deputy Commissioner District Operations
  - Assistant Commissioner Districts
- Deputy Commissioner National Operations
  - Assistant Commissioner Prevention
- Deputy Commissioner Resource Management
- Deputy Chief Executive People
- Deputy Chief Executive Public Affairs
- Deputy Chief Executive Strategy
  - Assistant Commissioner Strategy and Transformation

Deputy Chief Executive
Maori, Pacific & Ethnic Services

Where the ethnic strategy and adviser sit

District Commanders

The districts – where most people experience policing (responsiveness)
Systems and structures

Identifying functions and relationships of Ethnic Services within a large hierarchical government department –

NZ Police example
Police ethnic responsiveness (assets) sit on the margins of policing.
Identified issue:
Disjuncture between the organisation’s priorities and points of influence (embodied in organisational structure) and its Settlement Strategy and Ethnic Services.
NZ Police: Change over time

Being able to appreciate specific and accreting positive changes in ethnic responsiveness while noting lag and challenging events, windows of opportunity and periods of hiatus.
CNSST: Mozhe shitou guo he

Noting CNSST’s growing reach (7 centres) and engagement with people (380,000)
For newcomers, successful settlement and integration is expressed through increased diversity [acceptance of] and being able to create a space/place for yourself and supporting others to.

**Relationships and places**

**2003**
- Asian Liaison roles established (Waitemata / Auckland) [2]

**2004**
- First **uniformed Ethnic Liaison Officer** [3]

**2012**
- First **ethnic Inspector** appointed, becoming the National Strategic Ethnic Advisor

**2014**
- Gandhi Nivas early intervention family violence facility established by Counties Manukau police with community partners

**2018**
- Gandhi Nivas Two additional houses were established in Te Atatu and Papakura – 3 in total

**First District Ethnic Manager** appointed – overseeing Ethnic Services across Tamaki Mākaurau

**Making achievements visible**
CNSST: Relationships and places

Panmure:

- An education institute and cultural learning centre
- Employment support
- Wrap-around social service
- Parenting and after school programmes
- Immigration advice
- Social housing for Chinese seniors
- Planned enhancements including a cafe and weekend market, particularly engaging elders
- A site of cultural events and celebrations festivities and civic engagement
- And six additional learning centres across Tamaki Makaurau
Relationships and places

- Ordinary/everyday acts of recognition and kindness are critical to ethnic responsiveness.

- Workplaces are hugely instrumental in helping newcomers settle and belong.

- Migrants express being ‘more’ than they might have otherwise been through making a life in New Zealand and demonstrate that New Zealand is a better place for their efforts.

- Partners sometimes less successful in their source country professions but being part of a family that has successfully settled here is reported to make such disparities or sacrifices acceptable. [relationships and family wellbeing is primary]
Identified issues

1. Community-based Individuals and organisations **often experience government as fundamentally misunderstanding what they are about, or what it takes to make a positive difference** [they want to be seen and understood]

2. Community-based Individuals and organisations **want [and need] to partner with government in a genuine (inclusive) way.**

3. ‘Ethnic’ public servants **experience organisational structures and aspects of organisational culture as everyday barriers**

4. People in influential positions shape what is possible in a complex system – consequently personal dispositions and relationships affect outcomes [Police responsiveness in Christchurch, Hamilton ELPNZ model, CNSST’s organisational culture is highly relational and about community-making]
Implications for govt. policy

● New pathways for conveying the reach and impact and potentiality of organisation work across whole of government

● Sentinel organisations and sites for investigating in more depth:
  ○ How community organisations create/add value across multiple dimensions
  ○ Systemic constraints to settlement / improved partnering and innovation / better aligning policies and services / increasing responsiveness to needs
  ○ How (why & when) structures and policy priorities marginalise responsiveness / signal tokenistic endeavor
  ○ How policies, structures, roles could be mutually reinforcing

● All could benefit by undertaking and reflecting together on:
  ○ Community (participatory) assessments - rolling surveys of communities (assets, opportunities for development)
  ○ Most significant change narratives – what is the direction, nature and level of impact in the settlement and integration space (beyond metrics)
CaDDANZ
Capturing the Diversity Dividend
of Aotearoa/New Zealand